Defining the American Community: Drama and the Other

Curriculum Unit 14.02.08
by Eric W. Maroney

Representation of the world, like the world itself, is the work of men; they describe it from their own point of view, which they confuse with the absolute truth.

Simone de Beauvoir

Unit Overview

In this unit students will use an ethnographic approach to engage with theatrical writing. Drama, like all forms of representation, demands that the creator make choices about how to best present the story of others on the stage, on the page, the screen, etc. In doing so, artists' choices impact the aesthetic presentation of the work but also impact the meaning. These decisions sometimes have thematic implications and certainly alter the reader/viewers interpretation of the text but they also have larger sociopolitical ramifications. For example, the choices a stage manager makes regarding a female character including her costume and positioning on stage may communicate ideas about women as a social grouping in addition to illustrating the character individually. This The relationship between staging choices and representation becomes more significant when the writing is political in nature or seeks to represent specific communities or populations such as the Laramie Project by Moises Kauffman and, Fires in the Mirror by Anna Deavere Smith. Both of these texts (which are further described in the Anchor Text section of this unit) are the work of interview and ethnographic study. Both represent marginalized populations in the wake of tragic social unrest and allow for investigation of the communities' understanding of itself.

Student Body

This unit is written for students in grade 12 at the Engineering and Science University Magnet School, which defines itself as a public college preparatory middle and high school, that challenges students to imagine, investigate, and invent while preparing them for demanding STEM programs at the collegiate level.
STEM, ESUMS students have a broad range of interests from politics to art, pop culture to multi-culturalism. Like many young people, ESUMS high school students are in search of the language needed to make sense of their world.

English classes at ESUMS are not tracked; students of mixed ability occupy the same classroom except for those enrolled in AP Language and Composition and, AP Literature, which are available in the junior and senior years respectively. Those students designated as Honors are given additional coursework and more complex performance tasks within the heterogeneous classroom.

The school is racially and ethnically diverse: 44% of students are identified as Black or African American, 47% of students are identified as White, 17% of students are identified as Hispanic and 7% of students are identified as Asian. Within the school, racial and ethnic groups mix in social settings and friendships; although no rigid separation between groups is apparent, racially insensitive statements are present in the school. ESUMS has a significant sex imbalance with 69% of students identified as male and 31% of students identified as female. This sex imbalance has led some female students to complain of feeling marginalized in the classroom. Male students tend to dominate discussion particularly in math and the sciences. The use of ethnographic lens and critical literacy (described below) is, in part, designed to encourage discourse among students about the social inequalities existing within the school walls.

**Rationale**

The Common Core State Standards emphasize the need for students to engage with complex texts while analyzing the way author's choices (tone, selection of detail, diction, etc.) contribute to the construction of meaning. This close reading, a strategy for purposeful reading and rereading of a text which often includes annotation, allows students to unpack the layers of meaning in a text, examining not only what a text means but also how a text means. "A significant body of research links the close reading of complex text—whether the student is a struggling reader or advanced—to significant gains in reading proficiency and finds close reading to be a key component of college and career readiness."¹ Many high school students, particularly in the 9th and 10th grade lack experience with close read analysis and therefore find the task uncomfortable and foreign. Students in grades 11 and 12 also require additional practice of this skill as they confront more complex texts in preparation for post secondary education. This need to increase students' ability to closely analyze a text is further made difficult when students disengage due to a perception that a task is too complex or lacks interest.

This unit uses the lens of community and ethnographic study to strengthen students' ability to closely read text. If a student is able to closely read what a text (written, visual or, dramatic) says about a community they are familiar with, this same skill can be transferred to the analytic examination of literature; "the skills of 'reading a text' closely parallel thoughtful reflection on the "text" of human behavior."² Students may perform a close read of film, television, or advertisements to strengthen their ability to make note of details and artists' techniques, interpreting and analyzing how these technical choices construct sociopolitical representations of communities. This practice is in service of the same skill required of AP examinations and the Common Core State Standards.

The unit is also designed to strengthen written ability, including voice, and uses writing as the primary vehicle
for inquiry and knowledge construction. Ethnography will be used to engage students in the same kinds of questioning and observation that making the close reading of a written passage calls for. Additionally ethnographic writing expands the range of writing that students practice; "Ethnography bridges the gap between the self reflection we encourage in journal writing and the critical thinking we teach in literary analyses." 3

In the unit, Defining the American Community: Drama and the Other, students will explore how theatre constructs representation of community, both negative and positive, and the ways in which drama can be used for social change (political theater and community theater). Ultimately, students will be equipped with a sociological lens (Marxist, feminist, critical race) that will allow them to explore the ways in which dramatic texts construct community. Anchor texts will focus on communities that include marginalized identities. In that spirit, students will explore the ways artists’ choices impact meaning and affect depictions of community. An example might be examining how casting only actors of color alters the meaning of Death of a Salesman as produced at the Yale Repertory Theater several years ago. The unit is designed around a performance task that requires students interview representatives from communities of their choosing and use these interviews as the basis of composing monologues.

The 11-12 NHPS ELA curriculum is currently under revision by a committee of teachers to better align instruction with the Common Core Standards and allow more space for individual teacher input and creativity. The curriculum is structured around a series of conceptual units that can be paired with a selection of performance tasks to assess both conceptual learning and skill. One of the units currently in production concerns American Drama and themes of the American Ethos. That unit focuses on the Common Core State Standard RL.11-12.7, "Analyze multiple interpretations of a story, drama, or poem (e.g., recorded or live production of a play or recorded novel or poetry), evaluating how each version interprets the source text. (Include at least one play by Shakespeare and one play by an American dramatist.)" This Yale New Haven Teachers Institute unit can be used to augment and extend what is being written for the NHPS ELA curriculum or it can be taught as a stand-alone unit. Defining the American Community: Drama and the Other will enable students to put into practice understandings they have gained through the examination of multiple versions of a given text. As authors and directors of their own dramas, they must consider the choices they make in representing their subjects (communities) in much the same way a director makes purposeful choices when retelling a classic narrative.

**Pedagogical Framework and Teaching Strategies**

This unit is conceptualized using a framework of critical literacy, which challenges students to identify and analyze underlying assumptions of a text. Cara M. Mulcahy in her essay, "The Tangled Web We Weave: Critical Literacy and Critical Thinking," defines critical literacy as, "...a philosophy that recognizes the connections between power, knowledge, language and ideology and recognizes the inequalities and injustices surrounding us in order to move toward transformative action and social justice." 4 The essential questions of this unit (particularly, Who has the authority to represent? Who decides?) work within this framework for understanding literacy. In this sense, the English classroom becomes more than a place to study and analyze great literature but a place of inquiry where literature is interrogated regarding the ideologies and conventions it subverts or reinforces. Malcahy further establishes her definition of critical literacy stating, "critical literacy
examines texts in order to identify and challenge social constructs, underlying assumptions and ideologies, and power structures that intentionally or unintentionally perpetuate social injustices and inequalities." This pedagogical approach fits with Common Core State Standard RL.11-12.7, which is at the heart of the unit requiring students to examine how multiple interpretations of a text present the source text. The literary choices a writer makes are, in a sense, political. This unit requires students to investigate those choices and determine how they complicate an author's representation of a particular community. Students will then use this same approach when operating as writers, thinking carefully and critically about the ways they choose to represent their subjects.

This unit also uses a service learning approach to mitigate disengagement. Although students will be practicing complex analytical reading and writing skills, they will also be synthesizing this constructed knowledge to produce a work of art (drama). Students at the Engineering and Science themed high school are most engaged by hands on learning experiences that allow them to create a product that has an authentic audience. Science fair, debate club, technology expos, poetry slams and student film competitions all attract high student participation and enthusiasm. Using the service learning approach to the unit’s performance task draws on a significant level of conceptual understanding while increasing engagement. Service learning is an approach to teaching that blends learning with community service or social justice practice. Service learning is applicable to this unit as students will be investigating and representing marginalized communities both inside and outside the school setting. The performance task (described below) allows students to display their knowledge and understandings while also giving theatrical representation to underrepresented populations. As an extension of this methodology, students might perform their works for community centers or raise donations from performances for a particular cause connected with represented community.

The marriage between critical literacy and service learning, which is sometimes referred to as social justice teaching, is essential. It is not enough to teach students to identify the ideological components of a text—the ways in which it subverts or reinforces dominant ideals. Students must also be equipped with a means to enter into dialogue with the text’s ideologies or push back on them, if they should choose to. This approach requires the teacher to present students with texts (visual, written, dramatic, or real life) and guide students through a series of problematizing questions. Bill Bigelow, editor of Rethinking Schools explains the role of the teacher in social justice teaching, "As teachers, it's not our job—and it's not effective—to simply tell our political conclusions to students. But we can pose problems to students and engage them in experiences that encourage them to think about the roots of social and environmental problems. Additionally we must empower students and infuse hope into our classrooms. Bigelow poses the question, "how do we teach about the enormity of injustice in the world and yet not totally discourage students?" Hope comes through action. Students must be given the tools to investigate their world and then given the space to do something about it.

Essential Questions

- How do artists' choices for telling a story (including media format) impact the way we interpret it?
- What is representation?
- What is community?
- Who has the authority to represent? Who decides?

Supporting Questions

Curriculum Unit 14.02.08
- How do choices regarding race, gender, sexuality and class impact the meaning and experience of a text?
- Can a person from the outside represent a community? How?

**Unit Objectives**

The aim of this unit is for students to be able to:

- Question a text's representation of a community by analyzing author's choice of literary techniques such as selection of detail, tone, character voice, etc.
- Craft interview questions.
- Produce theatrical writing from interviews with consideration of what to include and what to omit to create adequate representation.
- Understand that the choices an artist makes are influenced by the larger social and political paradigms.
- Understand that representation is a political act that requires thoughtful choices and sensitivity toward one's subjects.

**Pacing and Structure**

The unit is designed to be taught in 4-5 weeks. During the first two weeks students will read excerpts from the anchor texts listed below and investigate ideas of community with a focus on close reading. Students will examine the texts representation of marginalized identities and engage with Marxist, feminist and critical race theories to inform their analysis. In week 3, students will become familiarized with the performance task. The teacher will guide students to think about which community they will use as a source text. Seminar discussions will lead students to generate interview questions and establishing a focus for the ethnography. In weeks 4 and 5, students will conduct interviews, write scripts and participate in peer review activities.

**Anchor Texts**

**Laramie Project. Kauffman, Moises**

The play is about the town of Laramie, its citizens and their reaction to the brutal murder of Mathew Sheppard who was profiled and then beaten to death because of his sexual orientation. The play was written based on interviews and diaries conducted and kept by members of the Tectonic Theater Company.

**Fires in the Mirror. Smith, Anna Deavere**

The play is about the 1991 riots that took place in Crown Heights, Brooklyn following the death of a 7 year old Caribbean American boy who was hit by a car driven by a Jewish man and the stabbing of a Jewish student who was visiting from Australia. The production is based on interviews conducted with 26 different community members.
Both texts are useful for considering the way writers of documentary drama construct theatrical presentations of a community's experience. The texts are useful for exploring the ways individuals perceive themselves and their communities.

**Performance Task**

**Part 1**

Following a study of the anchor text(s) during which students analyze choices the artists have made in representing particular communities both on the page and on screen/stage, students will create their own documentary theater. Students will select a community inside or outside the school and conduct a series of interviews. The community can be a subset within a larger community. For example, student writers may choose to interview students who attend New Haven Schools from other districts, students who participate in particular clubs, students of a particular gender, religion, ethnic background, etc. Student-writers may also choose to explore a community outside the school such as a church or community center. The interviews that student writers' conduct will be used to compose three to five monologues. The monologues will be presented to the class as a live production or video.

**Part 2**

After writing and producing the monologues, students will write a short reflection explaining the choices they made in staging the production. This includes an explanation of considerations taken for representing a community. The production and reflection allow the instructor to assess student understanding of the essential questions and skills outlined in unit objectives.

**Sample Lesson Plans**

**Lesson One**

Warm up/ Do Now: What is a community? Students will journal on this topic for 10 minutes. Following the journaling, students will turn to a partner and share. Teacher will then call the class together in a whole group and select pairs of students to share what similarities and differences they found between their understandings of community. Students will take notes on the conversation as it develops.

Say: Now that we have heard some ideas about community let's see if we can arrive at a definition. With student input teacher will write a definition of community. This may include characteristics such as shared identity, common history, common environment, shared social circumstances, cooperation, cultural markers (ie. food or music) shared belief systems, etc. Post this definition in the classroom on a piece of chart paper. Student will also have written the definition in their notes. Emphasize that this is the class definition of community for now and that likely it will change throughout the unit. Also emphasize that students may create their own definitions as the unit progresses and that individuals may come away with different understandings of what community is.
Explain: We will be looking at a series of TV clips to investigate and complicate our understanding of community. As we watch the clips I would like you to think about what kinds of communities you see and what characteristics those communities share. Using an LCD projector, play Episode 6, season one of Orange is the New Black. Begin episode at 14:50 and let it run until 21:37. After the clip has played, ask students what communities were depicted and what characteristics defined those communities. Because students are likely unfamiliar with the kinds of observations an ethnographer might make, it is important to model a thinking aloud. Teacher should highlight that although there is some disagreement within the white community regarding the racist ideology Lorna (Yael Stone's character) presents, the community is accepting of these beliefs. The white community is the only one to articulate the absurdity of the racial and age divisions in the Women's Advisory Council election process, but they are also complicit in its existence. Nicky (Natasha Lyonne's character) says "pretend it's the 1950's. That will make it easier to understand," and Alex (played by Laura Pepron) seems to encourage Lorna's racism, "Let's hear more about Lorna's racism." Although Alex, Nicky and Pepper are not overtly racist, their silence or tacit encouragement suggests a shared belief system.

The black community defines itself largely in opposition to the white community. This is seen when Tastee (Danielle Brook's character) and Poussey (played by Samira Wiley) imitate "white speech" when degrading Sofia (Laverne Cox's character). Interestingly although Tastee and Poussey do comment on Sofia's status as a transwoman, her outsider status seems to come more from her "white politics" than her nonconforming gender identity. Tastee and Poussey go on at length mocking Sofia's "white politics" through their imitation of "white talk" while only passing derogatory remarks regarding her transgender identity are present.

Following this discussion play Episode 6, season 1 from 29:28 until 31:20 and 37:30 until 42:00. As the clips play students should continue to think about the communities that are present in the text and what characteristics define the communities. In discussion, students may again discuss racism, shared belief systems, religion, food, and culture (including hair care).

Following the second discussion Say: Now that we have made some observations about communities and characteristics of communities, I want you to think about how the communities interact. Is there any overlap in the communities? Are there any rules that govern behavior in the different communities? Do any communities have power over others? Play final clip from 51:04 to 55:05 and then play episode 7, season 1 from 5:16 to 8:53. These clips dramatize the results of the election and each community's reaction to the results. Episode 7 opens with the representatives meeting with prison counselor Healy and advocating for the needs of their group. Students will journal on the questions listed above. As students journal, monitor the room and select several students to share out their ideas in a whole class setting as closure to the lesson. For homework assign students to read a critical review of the show such as Slate's "What's a Nice Blonde Like Me Doing in Prison?" 7

Lesson two

Warm up: Students will read Indiewire article, "August Wilson Gets His Wish - Denzel Washington Is Ready To Direct 'Fences' For The Screen." 8 After reading ask students to journal in response to the essential questions (1) What is representation?(2) Who has the authority to represent and who decides? Following the journaling, students will turn to a partner and share. Teacher will then call the class together in a whole group and select pairs of students to discuss their ideas of representation.

Instruct students to take out their reading from the previous class with their notes on it: Slate's "What's a Nice Blonde Like Me Doing in Prison." Say: thinking about the August Wilson article and the Piper Kerman article, do
you think Kerman has the authority to represent the prison community? (Depending in on the skills focus, this exploration could be set up as a forced debate or a seminar style discussion).

Following the discussion, distribute: "A Former prisoner's Prisoner's Review of 'Orange is the New Black.' Students will read text independently marking claims of support for Kerman's authority to write the text, which they agree with. Ask Students: In what ways does the second review change or complicate your understanding of Kerman's authority to write Orange is the New Black? What are some issues an artist or ethnographer might have to consider when representing a community he/she is not part of? What are some issues an artist or ethnographer might have to consider when representing a community he/she is somewhat part of? What are some issues an artist or ethnographer might have to consider when representing a community he/she is part of? How does one know he/she is part of a community?

Closure: Brainstorm a list of communities you believe you are part of? Brainstorm a list of communities that you come in contact which you might not be part of (ex. the teachers).

Lesson Three

Warm up: Display images of the 1991 Crown Heights Riot (which might more accurately be conceived of as an urban rebellion). Ask students to share their inferences and reflections with a small group. Say: What do you notice? What conclusions can be drawn from the images? What communities are present? What characteristics define the communities? Allow five minutes for the small group discussion then play a video clip to provide background information regarding the Crown Heights Riots. Ask students to engage in a quick write to activate their initial thinking. Following the small group discussion and the quick write activity, call class together to generalize discussion. Prompt students to share their initial reactions to the film clip or share out key ideas from the group discussion.

Distribute copies of Fires in the Mirrors and explain to students that this is a series of monologues based on interviews of Black and Jewish individuals following the Crown Heights Riots. Direct students to "Near Enough to Reach," and read aloud. Model reader response using dialectical note taking to record responses during reading. Make note that the speaker in this monologue seems to understand the false dichotomy between the Hasidic and Black communities. The speaker, Letty Cottin Pogrebin, who represents the Black community, says "Only Jews listen/ only Jews take Blacks seriously/ only Jews see blacks as full human beings." Teacher will model making inferences, connections, and asking questions using dialectical notes. Say: I notice the speaker uses a lot of repetition in these three lines. I also notice the parallelism of the line structure. It seems the writer is trying to emphasize the speakers understanding that there is not such a large difference between the Black community and the Jewish community. In line 26 the speaker contrasts the Black community with the Jewish community stating "but Blacks is like a little child kicking up against Arnold Schwarzenegger/ when they/ when they have anything to say about the dominant culture." Say: Here I notice the speaker does not use standard English but African American Vernacular English, "But Blacks is." I wonder why the author chose to do this? Maybe she was trying to preserve the authenticity of her interview with Letty Cottin Pogrebin. I wonder if readers trust the argument put forward by this speaker less because of the authors choice of diction.

Students will work independently to read and record thoughts on "Seven Verses," "Issac," and "Lousy Language," using dialectical notes. When students have finished ask them to describe the ways the speakers define community. Students may focus on word choice, tone, or selection of detail. In order to prompt students think the teacher may need to make use of probing questions: How do the speakers define their
communities in the text? How has Smith represented the Black community? How has Smith represented the Jewish community? How do these speakers understand the cause of the riots? Why do the speakers contrast slavery and the Holocaust? Teacher may need to highlight that the idea of community tends seems to crystallize around the idea of degrees of injustice.

Assign students to read several of the monologues from the Hasidic community. This may be done in class or for homework. Students should write a brief informal reader response (1-2 pages) comparing and contrasting the way the two communities perceive the riots. Some guiding questions for the written comparison are: How do the speakers define their communities in the text? How has Smith represented the Hasidic community? How do these speakers understand the cause of the riots? How does this alter our ideas about community?

Unit Standards

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.11-12.3 Analyze the impact of the author's choices regarding how to develop and relate elements of a story or drama (e.g., where a story is set, how the action is ordered, how the characters are introduced and developed)

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.11-12.5 Analyze how an author's choices concerning how to structure specific parts of a text (e.g., the choice of where to begin or end a story, the choice to provide a comedic or tragic resolution) contribute to its overall structure and meaning as well as its aesthetic impact.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.RL.11-12.7 Analyze multiple interpretations of a story, drama, or poem (e.g., recorded or live production of a play or recorded novel or poetry), evaluating how each version interprets the source text. (Include at least one play by Shakespeare and one play by an American dramatist.)

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.W.11-12.3 Write narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, well-chosen details, and well-structured event sequences.

CCSS.ELA-LITERACY.SL.11-12.4 Present information, findings, and supporting evidence, conveying a clear and distinct perspective, such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning, alternative or opposing perspectives are addressed, and the organization, development, substance, and style are appropriate to purpose, audience, and a range of formal and informal tasks.

Annotated Bibliography


This resource details that way ethnography can be used in the secondary English classroom. The source examines the learning value of ethnographic study and provides suggestions about launching an ethnography assignment out of a novel study.

This resource is a guide to teaching critical lens to students. It provided suggested learning activities and templates for investigating literature.


This source provides various ideas for producing ethnography in the classroom. The source is specifically organized around the study of place and grows out of a reading of Zora Neal Hurston’s work. The document is useful for generating thought about the way ethnography may be used in the classroom it does not provide any rationale or research in support of its methods. Additionally the resource lists a variety of ideas for engaging with ethnography but fails to develop them.


This source provides a useful set of questions for engaging students in critical analysis of gender, race and class in a text. The guide is written specifically for analysis of television but the guiding questions are applicable to any text.


This document is a useful student friendly guide to researching and presenting a performance based in ethnographic study. The guide is written for university undergraduates but is applicable to the secondary classroom. The guide also provides rationale for why ethnographic study is a useful classroom tool.


This document was produced by the U.S. Department of Education. Its purpose is to provide a framework for teaching English Language Arts or Literacy instruction and to serve as a bridge between PARCC assessments and the Common Core Standards. Although the source does not provide lesson materials or classroom tools, it is a useful source for understand the standards shifts present in CCSS.


This text outlines the pedagogical approach of critical literacy which is teaching students to think critically about who a text represents and who it does not. The collection of essays provides practical ideas and descriptions of teachers implementing critical literacy practices alongside a technical literacy approach. Additionally the text provides examples of how a critical literacy curriculum might be applied to a math, science, history or secondary English class.
Notes


3. Arias


6. Please note that the text suggested here is adult, explicit in nature and makes use of racially charged language. It has been selected because of the way it depicts various communities within a larger community. It also investigates the ways a community might define itself in opposition to outsiders. It is advised to seek permission from supervisor and parents before showing these clips. Another text can be supplemented using the same method.


11. http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=W5U_v-2DYLg

12. Dialectical note taking is an AP College board recommended strategy for tracking reader response during reading. An explanation of the strategy can be found on the College Board’s website http://apcentral.collegeboard.com/apc/public/repository/ap04_preap_1_inter_st_3

589