The Economics of Inequality

Curriculum Unit 18.01.08
by Carolyn Streets

Synopsis

This unit aims to provide a framework for introducing economic theory as an instructional strategy supporting ELA comprehension skills. Titled The Economics of Inequality, the unit will examine the arguments germane to the study of economic inequity gleaned from the seminar titled An Introduction to Income Inequality in America: Economics, History, and Law for the 2018 Yale Teachers Institute. Enduring unit goals intend to build student capacity to become literacy-based economists by examining the relational patterns between economic inequality and mobility while reinforcing reading comprehension and writing skills through novel analysis. This approach is unique because currently there is no formalized alignment between English Language Arts standards, Standards in Economics, and economic education. As teachers explore this unit, it is hoped that strategies, especially those that support critical and extended thinking, are used as a springboard for learning. This unit considers a cross-curricular approach as it was designed with the intent for teachers to spark more ideas on how they can enrich their own pedagogy and engage in lesson development using economic literary across other core subjects. It is also hoped that students’ enduring understandings are made through text-to-self connections by reflecting on how the economy affects their own lives.

Introduction

Increasing wealth and income inequality has been a decades long touchstone issue in the United States. Income inequality is “the extent to which income is distributed in an uneven manner among a population. In the United States, income inequality, or the gap between the rich and everyone else, has been growing markedly, by every major statistical measure, for some 30 years.” ¹ The causal factors for increasing wealth and income inequality are wide-ranging. Understanding its intricacies is challenging as there are no exact answers that can be applied to resolve its fluidity and a large body of literature exists exploring this issue. The question is, then, how can we understand what causes gaps between wealth and income inequality, and what, if anything, can be done about it? It is important to recognize that this question is broad and cannot be resolved in one short answer. But, one way may be to examine how income inequality effects the ability of an
individual or group to change their economic status. Through analyzing the novel The Outsiders students will use leading economic theory to analyze character development and write an argumentative short essay discerning whether a character’s social mobility is an issue of inequity.

With the emphasis on improving literacy standards nationwide, using economic theory to analyze novels is a unique approach to help students build their reading comprehension and economic literacy. Economic literacy is the way in which we understand how the economy works and instruction can be designed to help students make key essential understandings from the standpoint of economic inequality. In fact, there are a host of novels that are recommended for middle school reading lists that teach economic inequality. For example, popular dystopian themed novels like The Hunger Games (Collins, 2008), Divergent (Roth, 2011), and the Maze Runner (Dashner, 2009) to classics like Fahrenheit 451 (Bradbury, 1953), or a contemporary classic like The Giver (Lowry, 1993) all use economic inequality to drive plot lines.

Since there is no roadmap merging ELA and Economic standards and because my unit is designed with middle school students in mind, deep consideration was given to how to best implement unit goals. The unit design assumes students in general have little to no background knowledge in economics. With this in mind, I believe it best to organize this unit first by providing a framework for students to conceptualize economic inequality, followed by notable arguments espoused by leading economists in support of students’ building their initial understandings, and then an overview of this unit’s instructional plan to implement student learning objectives.

Unit design will begin with understanding key ideas about The Great Gatsby Curve. The Great Gatsby Curve is an economic theory that is empirically proven and concludes a negative link between economic inequality and mobility. This curve espouses that “greater income inequality in one generation amplifies the consequences of having rich or poor parents for the economic status of the next generation.” The Great Gatsby Curve should help students form initial understandings that economic mobility is the movement between income levels, it denotes the economic status between the poor, middle class, and wealthy, and movement is contingent upon opportunity of equality.

Another framework will introduce students to how issues of inequality are perpetuated in a negative economic cycle. This framework will begin by defining that economics is the study of how an entity allocates its scarce resources and entities like government, businesses, or individuals can be distributors of resources (teachers can insert connections to popular dystopian novels that most students are familiar with to illustrate this definition). A negative economic cycle influences inequality, where “the combination of high inequality and low mobility could influence the behavior of disadvantaged youth in ways that further diminishes their chances of success. Then inequality begins to look like a vicious circle.” This cycle is prominently displayed throughout The Outsiders, and students will be encouraged to see relational patterns between inequality and a negative economic cycle.

This unit’s instructional approach recognizes economist Thomas Piketty’s argument on economic inequality. To summarize, “economic inequality occurs when wealth accumulation outpaces economic growth causing gaps between the rich, middle class, and poor. Economists note this adversely affects those in poverty who are will most likely never catch up to the socio-economic status of their wealthier counterparts.” Two of his conclusions deserve examination as they are sub-conflicts in The Outsiders’ plot line: 1. stagnant economic growth causes inequality, and 2. inequality creates fractions of society that will always compete for resources. Analysis is framed around how students see the problem, so recognizing Piketty’s arguments are essential in developing critical understandings.
Grade level materials are carefully selected to optimize student learning in alignment with this unit’s goals. Reading materials will draw upon key ideas from the seminar text Economic Inequity and The American Dream Under Siege, (Frazer, 2018) and arguments of leading economists that are germane to economic theory. Although there are no middle school texts specifically geared towards teaching this economic inequality, Frazer’s book will be used as a primary text because it is middle school appropriate. Readings germane to this unit will focus on specific the main ideas in chapter three, The Costs of Inequality, and chapter four, Inequality of Opportunity. These chapters are apropos to the goals of this unit because they underscore economic theory and can be analyzed through developmentally appropriate ELA strategies like compare and contrast, categorizing, summary, and argument writing.

Once perspectives are developed, students will focus on building their argument literacy via a writing task. To accomplish this, it is important to consider the strategy of argument literacy. Students’ ability to masterfully craft a strong argument is what Hillocks (2010) defines as “at the heart of critical thinking and academic discourse, the kind of writing students need to know for success in college... good arguments begin with looking at the data that are likely to become the evidence in an argument and that give rise to a thesis statement or major claim.” Using argument literacy, students will be required to take a stance on an issue of their choice germane to the themes identified in the novel and presented in the arguments of Frazer et al.

**Rationale**

The rationale for teaching economic literacy is echoed in the argument of many economists who agree that economic literacy is an issue of urgency because it is a foundational skill that students should learn because the economy is all around us, and that students will eventually need to make decisions on economic matters. Economists warn that students’ deficiencies in basic understanding about how the economy works can lead to uniformed adverse decisions that may have long-term negative effects that will directly affect their quality of life. Additionally, economists believe economic literacy to be the cornerstone of any democratic society therefore, schools should be the hub of economic education and be an intragale part of both middle and secondary curriculum. But, this is not always the case as economic courses are largely relegated to high school elective courses, is believed to be a topic too complicated for middle school aged students, and are secondary to nation-wide curricular objectives that focus primarily on improving math, science, and technology skills.

So, if the economy is an issue of urgency, shouldn’t it be required in general education? Consider Nobel Laureate George Stigler’s argument that “significant gaps in the economic education of youth be closed by giving economics a more central place in the school curriculum.” How the economy works is important for students to learn because the economy is a lived experience and is vital to their lives. Helping students navigate its intricacies is a valuable skill because income inequality is an issue of urgency. Leading economists conclude that “Americans today live in a starkly unequal society. Inequality is greater now than it has been at any time in the last century, and the gaps in wages, income, and wealth are wider here than they are in any other democratic and developed economy.” These issues will directly affect my students, and for them who will soon become adult contributors to our society, it is important to know the basics about the economy.

Although the topic of income inequality is not included in the middle school English Language Arts curriculum,
as an ELA teacher I have come to appreciate how using economic inequity thematically can help students take deeper critical stances. Therefore, the argument for economic literacy as a means of reinforcing reading comprehension skills is reflected throughout this unit because it places economic literacy at the forefront of the ELA curriculum and serves a resource for middle school teachers who may want to teach literary criticism through the lens of economic inequality.

Learning goals discussed in the objectives section will reflect the enduring understanding that income and opportunity widely differs between different groups of society, and this argument does, in fact, underpin the plot line of many ELA required readings, but is often overlooked as an entry point for student learning. I am excited to develop a unit that approaches student learning about economic literacy through novel analysis, a perspective not considered until participating in the 2018 Yale Teachers Institute seminar on economic inequality. Exposure to economic inequality and its effect on social mobility provides new strategies for novel analysis that the traditional ELA curriculum may otherwise overlook. This unit also presents opportunities for students to curate their own learning as cross curricular connections are infinite. Math and social studies connections for example are applicable to this unit and can be used as a springboard to generate content connections beyond ELA.

Objectives

There are creative ways to successfully merge the ELA curriculum with the study of economic inequality. It is of note that there is currently no alignment between ELA and Economic Education standards. Therefore, unit objectives are primarily guided by ELA Common Core Standards, but also recognizes a key National Content Standard in Economics (NCSE). Combining the two is a challenge of unit design, but I believe objectives should be anchored by the standards that serves as a guidepost. NCSE Standard 1 recognizes that tension between economic growth and stagnation occurs when: 1. productive resources are limited, and 2. people cannot have all the goods and service they want; as a result, they must choose some things and give up others. This standard speaks directly to The Great Gatsby Curve, which I intend to use as an entry point to build student understandings.

It also flows into ELA objectives where students will: 1. analyze how economic inequality and mobility interact to affect a characters’ development, and 2. use their critical and extended thinking about the relationship between economic inequality and social mobility to take an argumentative stance through a written short essay. Both ELA and NCSE objectives are intended to have a synergetic effect on student learning and are to occur in tandem with our reading of The Outsiders. Objectives R1-2 and W1 are critical in helping student mastery of unit goals. R1-2 grounds student understanding in theory and moves into them developing exemplars of their learning. W1 provides opportunities for students to defend their conclusions.

Objective R1: Cite textual evidence to support analysis of what the text says explicitly as well as inferences drawn from the text. The first objective will be address during our connections made to The Cost of Inequality in chapter three, Economic Inequality and The American Dream Under Siege. This chapter succinctly explains in graph form the economy's vicious cycle. This links back to the NCSE standard about limited resources and graphically illustrates the enduring effects of The Great Gatsby Curve. Students will integrate their understandings of the curve with their character analysis.
Objective R.2: Determine two or more central ideas in a text and analyze their development over the course of the text; provide an objective summary of the text. This objective will be addressed during our reading of chapter four, Inequality of Opportunity in Economic Inequality and The American Dream Under Siege. This chapter distinguishes absolute upward mobility and relative mobility which is key in helping students fine-tune their understandings of what economic mobility is and how issues of inequality impacts the “upward or downward movement of within or in between economic groups.” Students will use their understandings to write a collection of brief summaries as they connect to their character analysis that they will refer to as they read.

Objective W1: Write arguments to support claims with clear reasons and relevant evidence. This objective will be addressed when students prepare to write a short essay integrating their character analysis. Students will accomplish this objective using argumentative writing strategies including their understandings of studied theories and text evidence discerning a character’s economic mobility as it relates to issues of inequity.

**Strategies**

Novel analysis is a form of literary criticism and a foundational skill in the English Language Arts classroom where students study, evaluate, and interpret literature. Literary criticism is an aspect of Common Core reading standards that expect students to have a range of reading skills evidencing critical and extended thinking. To accomplish this, students must develop a cadre of core comprehension skills because deficiencies “point to a negative economic impact if we do not ensure that all students are college and career ready in regard to literacy.” Research-based strategies are anchored by Marzano’s high yield instructional strategies like graphic organizers, identifying relational patterns, and QAR (Question/Answer/Relationship for example. I will incorporate strategies in order to scaffold student learning, offer guidance, and give support as students build their comprehension. Three primary strategies I will use are graphic organizers, QAR, and buzz groups.

**Graphic Organizer**

Graphic organizers are pedagogical tools used in all classrooms regardless of subject matter. This strategy will be used to meet Objective R1 as students read chapter three, The Costs Of Inequality, and are introduced to newly acquired information about the economy’s vicious cycle and how it relates to The Great Gatsby Curve. I find this strategy essential because in enables students to internalize information through a visual modality similar to how information is presented in chapter three. Using this strategy to help students make connections will better position them to see relational patterns.

**QAR (Question-Answer-Relationship)**

The QAR method is a tried and true strategy found in any ELA classroom. QAR helps students see the relationship between asking open end questions, finding text based answers, and then seeing the relationship between the question, answer, and independent understanding. This strategy will be used to accomplish Objective R2 and to help formulate their initial understandings, confirm understandings, and frame feedback conversations around their critical thinking.
**Buzz Groups**

Buzz groups are a way students engaged in focused conversations similar to the “turn and share” method. During buzz groups, students share information with groups members. This sharing happens in multiple groups at one time. Members then break off into different groups, sharing knowledge gathered from previous groups. Students “buzz” information around from different groups, sharing and learning new information.

**Classroom Activities**

It is important to reiterate that there are no aligned ELA and economic standards. Therefore, classroom activities are ideas that teachers can use to implement lesson objectives in tandem with reading the novel. It is if note that there are several places in The Outsiders that teachers can decide best fit in with this unit, and students should be reading the novel and connecting their learning to apropos chapters. I envision the activities being implemented during reading and writing workshop and can be paced according to student needs. I also envision using the Gradual Release of Responsibility instructional model moving from teacher guided to student independent practice where activities where instruction “purposefully shifts the cognitive load from teacher-as-model, to joint responsibility of teacher and learner, to independent practice and application by the learner.” This model is key to meeting Common Core and state standards for students to build their critical and extended thinking. Activities are designed to follow this model, but are flexible enough for differentiation. To open lesson activities, students will consider essential focus statements. There are many ways to teach this novel, so in deference to time, the audiobook version may be helpful. There are also several online resources such as summaries, movie clip versions of the novel, and student exemplars that may be useful to incorporate at the teacher’s digression.

**Initiating Activity**

Reading Workshop: To bring context to issues of mobility, students will use a living wage calculator to estimate the cost of living. Through this activity, students will conclude that a living wage is the minimum income needed to sustain basic needs like food, clothing, and shelter. Minimum wage also varies depending on geographical location. The novel takes place in rural Oklahoma, so students will use their estimates to calculate individual expenses, expenses according to family size, and will take into consideration the characters’ geographical location. Students will need to make adjustments for inflation and compare character’s wages to that of today. Since the novel takes place in 1967, it is important to recognize inflation. I anticipate some students may struggle with this, so I will provide a brief conversation on what inflation is. Students will know that inflation is when prices rise based on the economy. Inflation is the rate at which the level of prices for goods rise and the purchasing power of the currency falls. I will help students understand this through visual aids. For example, I will show the average price of general goods such as bread, milk, and eggs between the decades and have students generate conversations around why they think prices have decreased or increased. Students will also discuss how the value of currency changed over time.

Writing Workshop: Students will then form hypothesis and craft a brief write around one of these questions: 1. Does the cost of living support an equitable quality of life for all, some, or most of the characters? and 3. What conclusions can you draw about a characters’ economic mobility? After brief writes, students will turn and share to provide an overview of their hypothesis. Students will be tasked with asking probing questions to help confirm or adjust their thinking. Further adjustments can be assigned for homework and reviewed in class the following day.
Activity One: Essential Focus: The economy profoundly effects the lives of people.

Reading Workshop: I will introduce Objective R1 by having students reflect on the essential understanding first through a turn and share and then using a brief student friendly video titled Economy Definition for Kids. This video introduces key terms such as “producer,” “consumer,” “goods,” and “services.” It also succinctly explains how the economy works in kid friendly language and visual detail. Most importantly, it provides a segue to Piketty’s argument that: 1. stagnant economic growth causes inequality, and 2. inequality creates fractions of society that will always compete for resources, two sub-conflicts in The Outsiders' plot line. I will create the opportunity for students to explore this deeper by turning the essential focus into an open ended question by asking students to brainstorm about what happens when the economy slows and resources become fewer? I will keep a running class chart of brainstormed ideas to reference throughout the lesson and students will be encouraged to note any similarities between their brainstorming and character development. This will flow into our reading of chapter three, The Costs of Inequality and specifically focus on the economy's vicious cycle graph.

Writing Workshop: Students will use their graphs explained in the Objectives Section to solidify initial understandings. Students will create a visual picture of how a vicious economic cycle works and connect exemplars from The Outsiders. Falling wages or fewer resources alluded through character narration and experiences are examples I will encourage students to look for. They key is for students to draw parallels between vicious economic cycles and The Great Gatsby Curve noting that the cyclical nature of economic inequity predicts generational poverty or wealth. They will then use their organizers to write predictions of how this may effect issues of economic inequality according to The Great Gatsby Curve theory. For homework, students will complete a brief write (one-two short paragraphs) summarizing what they learned.

Activity Two: Essential Focus: The American Dream is accessible to everyone.

Reading Workshop: To introduce Objective R2, students will review the data reported on the Equality of Opportunity Project. This site defines the American Dream as, “upward income mobility: the ideal that children have a higher standard of living than their parents,” and will be used to facilitate discussion on absolute and relative mobility. They will use the geography of mobility map to engage in a robust discussion and make predictions about the type of mobility a character will most likely face.

Students will keep a QAR rolling notebook where they will ask inferential open end questions about a character as they read. They will then switch journals with partners to work collaboratively on the answer portion. The Q and A aspect of the strategy should connect to their understandings gleaned from chapter four, Inequality Of Opportunity where they use text evidence to decide if a character is most affected by absolute or relative mobility. The R sections of their notebooks also gleaned from chapter four, should detail the relationship between issues of inequality and economic mobility as they see it unfold as they read.

A compare and contrast mini lesson may be inserted here where students graph similarities and differences between the two types of mobility. They can use their graphs to engage in informal debates arguing where they saw examples of inequality in mobility or how it affected a character’s development. They can also use their compare/contrast graphs to confirm or adjust their QAR.

Writing Workshop: Students will re-examine their QAR and graphs and write a brief reflection about what they learned. They will craft a brief write around the essential focus question: The American Dream is accessible to everyone. Students will finish their reflections for homework and will review in groups the following day.
Activity Three: Activity three slightly differs from the other activities as the essential questions shift to an essential quote. This quote was specifically chosen to help students draw conclusions and take an argumentative stance. This quote also best summarizes the crux of the novel where characters are limited by their opportunities. I anticipate this quote to spark deeper thought and debate along with what students have already generated in their QAR notebooks. Using the article titled Our Inequality: An Introduction, (Gordon, 2014), students will examine key points about income inequality and will add key main ideas to their QAR notebook.

Essential Quote: “Inequity matters, most obviously and directly, to those whom it leaves behind. This includes the very poor- the “underclass” or the “truly disadvantaged...who have long been cordoned off from the rewards and opportunities enjoyed by most Americans…” 17

A version of the buzz group strategy will be used to meet Objective W1. Before students begin to write their first drafts, they will break into sub- groups to discuss key understandings from their QAR notebooks, graphic organizers, and overall conclusions drawn from their readings. Sharing information in this setting is a way for students to learn from each other and engage in focused-based discussions. Representatives from each group will move to alternating groups and share information. This is an effective way to disseminate large amounts of information and put students in charge of sharing the information (I think of this strategy as a more versatile version of fishbowl groups or similar strategies). Students will generate an argumentative writing template to outline their drafts (argumentative writing strategies are taught year long and students already have a working knowledge on how to formulate an argument. W1 objective focuses on fine tuning pre-taught writing strategies.) Students will examine the essential quote and use it to generate a thesis for their arguments. The following week can be dedicated to students writing their argument drafts and engaging in the writing cycle of drafting, editing, feedback and revision.

Resources


This magazine article introduces the concepts used in this novel. It is a scholarly article that discusses the causes of inequality and provides examples how inequality is pervasive.


This article summarizes the argument for economic literacy in schools. It can be used as an exemplar argument for students as they develop their argument literacy.

Inequality.” Inequality.org, Institute for Policy Studies, inequality.org/facts/income-inequality/.

This article presents the causes of income inequality. It will be used to induce the concept of income inequality as an entry point for students.

This book is very dense and not recommended to be used with middle school students. However, the arguments presented by Piketty can be teased out to help students explore the argument around economic inequality. Students can take aspects of Piketty’s point of view and use it to develop their own perspectives.


This article presents the theory supporting The Great Gatsby Curve. It contains useful perspectives on the cause and effect nature of how income inequality and social mobility. This is good resource to use for students to understand the reciprocal nature of income inequality and social mobility.


This article connects to the article on The Great Gatsby Curve. It does a deeper dive into the relationship between income inequality and social mobility.


This is a resource for teachers who wish to review high yield strategies as researched by Marzano and his team. These high yield strategies are referenced in the unit.


This journal provides the framework for the Gradual Release of Responsibility Model. This model is used in many classrooms of any subject and is a strategy that strongly supports students’ independent thinking.

Living Wage Calculator at MIT

This calculator was created in 2004 by Dr. Amy K. Glasmeier. founding editor of the Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy and Society. This calculator is helpful in applying the cost of living and framing understandings of economic inequality. Using this calculator, students can plot the cost of living.

Equality of Opportunity Project

This project provides real-time data for students to study issues of economic inequality. This project analyzes differences in between race and economic opportunity.

Appendix

The Common Core Standards and the New Haven Public Schools ELA curriculum focuses on students developing their critical and extended thinking skills. The ELA standards vary, but emphasize that students should be able to read and comprehend a variety of complex text with sophistication and for students to be on
This unit introduces economic inequality as a means for students to analyze the text by using ELA strategies to help students build upon their foundational skills. Using their argument literacy to determine aspects of social mobility is a way for students to support their writing skills where they will practice forming and supporting an argument.

**Endnotes**

15. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=CamHuVSm_iQ